

Working Paper on NRL Selection Criteria

prepared by Max Cowan

1. Introduction

With the NRL Selection Criteria finally being available it is incumbent on Clubs to determine their position relative to that criteria.

The Criteria has been segmented into 3 parts. This paper addresses only Part C - Selection Criteria. This section assigns clubs points for performance in 6 categories - Home Crowds, Away Crowds, Competition Points, Gate Receipts, Sponsorship and Other Income, and Profitability.

We are able to accurately compare ourselves with other clubs for those categories where information is publicly available - Home Crowds, Away Crowds, and Competition Points.

My aim here is to walk you through those calculations and arrive at a comparative position for Panthers. The calculations in each category begin relatively simply and then a level of complexity is added through a bonusing system.

Home Crowds

Each club takes its top 16 home crowds over 1998 and 1999, adds them up.

These are then ranked so that the team with the highest aggregate gets 20 points and the lowest team gets 1 point.

After that teams attract bonus points -

Rankings	1 - 5	-	13	bonus points
Rankings	6 - 10	-	8	bonus points
Rankings	11 - 14	-	4	bonus points
Rankings	15 - 20	-	1	bonus points

Taking each club's top 8 home game crowds for 1998, the rankings and criteria points look like this, and would look like this after 1999 if teams delivered approximately the same crowds next year. We had 1 Saturday afternoon game - against Canberra. This game does not make our top 8 for 1998.

Team	Crowd	Ranking	Points	Bonus Points	Total Criteria Points
Brisbane	186,458	1	20	13	33
Newcastle	184,364	2	19	13	32
Nth Qld	160,410	3	18	13	31
Melbourne	118,427	4	17	13	30
Cronulla	111,082	5	16	13	29
Parramatta	105,563	6	15	8	23
Norths	102,952	7	14	8	22
Sydney City	101,927	8	13	8	21
St George	100,970	9	12	8	20
Balmain	100,785	10	11	8	19
Manly	88,429	11	10	4	14
Canberra	84,777	12	9	4	13
Penrith	81,670	13	8	4	12
Illawarra	81,029	14	7	4	11
Auckland	78,793	15	6	1	7
Canterbury	65,473	16	5	1	6
Adelaide	65,473	17	4	1	5
Wests	64,322	18	3	1	4
Gold Coast	62,615	19	2	1	3
Souths	56,092	20	1	1	2

Away Crowds

The process for allocating criteria points on the basis of away crowds is a bit more complex. For a start, all away games are considered when ranking the clubs.

Now, the visiting team that draws the biggest crowd to a particular ground is allocated a score of 12 for that venue and all other teams are scored according to their ranked position at that venue.

For example, at Penrith Stadium the scores so far are:

Newcastle	12	Parramatta	8	Canberra	4
St George	11	Souths	7	Adelaide.....	3
Brisbane	10	Balmain	6	Canterbury	2
Sydney City.....	9	Nth Queensland.....	5	Illawarra.....	1

This is done for every venue and the full picture won't be known until the end of Season 1999 when all teams have played at least once at every venue.

Penrith's crowds at away venues have been very poor this season ... the scores we have attracted at opposition venues so far are:

<u>Penrith v Opposition Team</u>	<u>Penrith Points for Crowd</u>
Adelaide	3
Auckland	5
Brisbane	7
Canberra	6
Gold Coast *	2
Cronulla	1
Manly	1
Melbourne *	4
Norths	3
Parramatta *	7
Balmain *	6
Wests	6

* Saturday afternoon games.

For the period contributing to the criteria we are still to play Canterbury, North Queensland, St George, Illawarra, Newcastle, Sydney City and Souths at their venues.

Our score, so far, for away games totals 51. To get the points we earn towards the criteria we have to compare that score to the scores of the other teams.

Once again, the top ranked team will get 20 criteria points and the last will get 1 criteria point.

Bonus points will also be issued - 13 points to teams 1-5, 8 points 6-10, 4 points 11-14, 1 point to teams 15-20.

Here's the table for away crowds:

Team	Away Score	Rank	Points	Bonus Points	Total Criteria Points
Brisbane	121	1	20	13	33
St George	110	2	19	13	32
Manly	110	3	18	13	31
Parramatta	106	4	17	13	30
Melbourne	105	5	16	13	29
Sydney City	98	6	15	8	23
Newcastle	90	7	14	8	22
Cronulla	86	8	12.5	8	20.5
Balmain	86	8	12.5	8	20.5
Canterbury	85	10	11	8	19
Canberra	78	11	10	4	14
Norths	76	12	9	4	13
Nth Qld	74	13	7.5	4	11.5
Souths	74	13	7.5	4	11.5
Auckland	66	15	6	1	7
Penrith	51	16	5	1	6
Wests	43	17	4	1	5
Illawarra	42	18	3	1	4
Adelaide	35	19	2	1	3
Gold Coast	24	20	1	1	2

Crowds

Here is a table showing the comparative position of teams relative to criteria points for crowds – combined home and away.

<u>Team</u>	<u>Crowd Criteria Points</u>
Brisbane	66
Melbourne	59
Newcastle	54
Parramatta	53
St George	52
Cronulla	49.5
Manly	45
Sydney City	44
Nth Queensland	42.5
Balmain	39.5
Norths	35
Canberra	27
Canterbury	25
Penrith	18
Illawarra	15
Auckland	14
Souths	13.5
Wests	9
Adelaide	8
Gold Coast	5

To give you an idea of how difficult it would be to jump up a placing on this list, if we improved our home crowds in 1999 so that every game at Penrith Stadium has a crowd equal to our biggest this year (12,284) we would have increased our criteria points by 1. That is we would have 19 criteria points for crowds.

Competition Performance

This one is the most complex of the lot because it runs across 4 years, with multiple bonus levels, and weightings given to each year.

Basically teams are ranked according to their finishing spot after the home and away series – minor premiers score 20, wooden spooners 1.

Teams finishing	1 - 5	-	13	bonus points
Teams finishing	6 - 10	-	8	bonus points
Teams finishing	11 - 14	-	4	bonus points
Teams finishing	15 - 20	-	1	bonus points

The premiers receive an additional 10 points. The runners up receive an additional 5 points.

Note: Bonus points are not subject to a weighting.

Gold Coast, Melbourne and Adelaide have been excluded from calculations for 1995 and 1996 but have been given extra weighting for 1997 and 1998.

Here's how the teams scored in 1995:

Team	Table Position	Basic Points	Bonus	Grand Final Bonus	Total 1995
Manly	1	20	13	5	38
Canberra	2	19	13		32
Brisbane	3	18	13		31
Cronulla	4	17	13		30
Newcastle	5	16	13		29
Canterbury	6	15	8	10	33
St George	7	14	8		22
Norths	8	13	8		21
Sydney City	9	12	8		20
Auckland	10	11	8		19
Perth	11	-	-		-
Illawarra	12	9	4		13
Wests	13	8	4		12
Penrith	14	7	4		11
Balmain	15	6	1		7
Sth Queensland	16	-	-		-
Gold Coast	17	-	-		-
Souths	18	3	1		4
Parramatta	19	2	1		3
Nth Queensland	20	1	1		2

We now have to do the same thing for years 1996, 1998, and 1999 ... except we have to weight the basic points. In 1996 we'll multiply them by 2, in 1998 by 3, and in 1999 by 4. In the case of Gold Coast, Adelaide and Melbourne no points will be counted until 1998, which will be multiplied by 4, and in 1999 points will be multiplied by 6.

Here's how the teams scored in 1996:

Team	1996 Table Position	Basic Points	(x 2)	Bonus	Grand Final Bonus	Total 1996
Manly	1	20	40	13	10	63
Brisbane	2	19	38	13		51
Norths	3	18	36	13		49
Sydney City	4	17	34	13		47
Cronulla	5	16	32	13		45
Canberra	6	15	30	8		38
St George	7	14	28	8	5	41
Wests	8	13	26	8		34
Newcastle	9	12	24	8		32
Canterbury	10	11	22	8		30
Auckland	11	10	20	4		24
Balmain	12	9	18	4		22
Parramatta	13	8	16	4		20
Illawarra	14	7	14	4		18
Penrith	15	6	12	1		13
Perth	16	-	-	-		-
Nth Queensland	17	4	8	1		9
Gold Coast	18	-	-	-		-
Souths	19	2	4	1		5
Sth Queensland	20	-	-	-		-

Here's how the scores are for 1998 at the time of writing:

Team	1998 Table Position	Basic Points	(x 3)	Bonus	Grand Final Bonus	Total 1998
Brisbane	1	20	60	13		73
Newcastle	2	19	57	13		70
Melbourne	3	18 (x4)	72	13		85
Parramatta	4	17	51	13		64
Norths	5	16	48	13		61
Sydney City	6	15	45	8		53
Canberra	7	14	42	8		50
St George	8	13	39	8		47
Canterbury	9	12	36	8		44
Manly	10	11	33	8		41
Cronulla	11	10	30	4		34
Illawarra	12	9	27	4		31
Balmain	13	8	24	4		28
Penrith	14	7	21	4		25
Auckland	15	6	18	1		19
Nth Queensland	16	5	15	1		16
Adelaide	17	4 (x4)	16	1		17
Souths	18	3	9	1		10
Gold Coast	19	2 (x4)	8	1		9
Wests	20	1	3	1		4

Note: Penrith finished equal with Auckland, and North Queensland. If for and against don't distinguish ranking we would score less than the 25 scored here.

Also, at time of writing, 4 teams were vying for the Grand Final Bonus Points.

To get the criteria points for competition performance we have to add the points gained for the years, rank the teams according to their total score. Then assign points according to the teams rank ... once again adding 13 bonus points for the top 5 etc.

Up to the end of 1998 we have the following:

Team	**			Total	Rank	Criteria Points	Bonus	Total
	1995 Points	1996 Points	1998 Points					
Brisbane	31	51	73	155	1	20	13	33
Manly	38	63	41	142	2	19	13	32
Newcastle	29	32	70	131	3	17.5	13	30.5
Norths	21	49	61	131	3	17.5	13	30.5
Sydney City	20	47	53	120	5	15.5	10.5	26
Canberra	32	38	50	120	5	15.5	10.5	26
St George	22	41	47	110	7	14	8	22
Cronulla	30	45	34	109	8	13	8	21
Canterbury	33	30	44	107	9	14	8	20
Parramatta	3	20	64	87	10	11	8	19
Melbourne	0	0	85	85	11	10	4	14
Illawarra	13	18	31	62	12	8.5	4	12.5
Auckland	19	24	19	62	12	8.5	4	12.5
Balmain	7	22	38	57	14	7	4	11
Wests	12	34	4	50	15	6	1	7
Penrith	11	13	25	49	16	5	1	6
Nth Qld	2	9	16	27	17	4	1	5
Souths	4	5	10	19	18	3	1	4
Adelaide	0	0	17	17	19	2	1	3
Gold Coast	0	0	9	9	20	1	1	2

** No Grand Final Bonus Points

Now if we add our current crowd points to our current competition points it looks like this:

Team	Home Crowd	Away Crowd	Competition	Total
Brisbane	33	33	33	99
Newcastle	32	22	30.5	84.5
Manly	14	31	32	77
St George	20	32	22	74
Melbourne	30	29	14	73
Parramatta	23	30	19	72
Cronulla	29	20.5	21	70.5
Sydney City	21	23	26	70
Norths	22	13	30.5	65.5
Canberra	13	14	25	53
Balmain	19	20.5	11	50.5
Nth Queensland	31	11.5	5	47.5
Canterbury	6	19	20	45
Illawarra	11	4	12.5	27.5
Auckland	7	7	12.5	26.5
Penrith	12	6	6	24
Souths	2	11.5	4	17.5
Wests	4	5	7	16
Adelaide	5	3	3	11
Gold Coast	3	2	2	7

1998 Grand Final Points not included.

If we are to get a real picture of how we stand as at the end of Season 98 we need to obtain some estimates of where we stand in relation to Gate Receipts, Sponsorship and Other Income, and Profitability.

Now let's also put in some estimates for the other 3 categories - Gate Receipts, Sponsorship and other income.

Gate Receipts

We are getting approximately \$4.25 per person in gate receipts. Other clubs are achieving better than this (except for Souths) so I've assumed they are getting around \$7 per head.

The rankings and points look like this ... remembering that this category attracts a weighting of 1.25.

Team	Rank	Points	Bonus Points	Criteria
Newcastle	1	20	13	41.25
Brisbane	2	19	13	40
Nth Queensland	3	18	13	38.75
Melbourne	4	17	13	37.5
Cronulla	5	16	13	36.25
Parramatta	6	15	8	28.75
Norths	7	14	8	27.5
Balmain	8	13	8	26.25
Manly	9	12	8	25
Sydney City	10	11	8	23.75
St George	11	10	4	17.5
Canberra	12	9	4	16.25
Illawarra	13	8	4	15
Auckland	14	7	4	13.75
Canterbury	15	6	1	8.75
Penrith	19	5	1	7.5
Adelaide	16	4	1	6.25
Wests	17	3	1	5
Gold Coast	18	2	1	3.25
Souths	20	1	1	2.5

Sponsorship and Other Income

For the category of Sponsorship and Other Income I've assumed the following rankings. I believe I have been optimistic.

This category attracts a weighting of 2.

Team	Rank	Points	Bonus Points	Criteria Point
Brisbane	1	20	13	66
Nth Queensland	2	19	13	64
Melbourne	3	18	13	62
Newcastle	4	17	13	60
Auckland	5	16	13	58
Parramatta	6	15	8	46
Cronulla	7	14	8	44
Canberra	8	13	8	42
Manly	9	12	8	40
Canterbury	10	11	8	38
St George	11	10	4	28
Sydney City	12	9	4	26
Norths	13	8	4	24
Penrith	14	7	4	22
Illawarra	15	6	1	14
Balmain	16	5	1	12
Adelaide	17	4	1	10
Souths	18	3	1	8
Wests	19	2	1	6
Gold Coast	20	1	1	4

Profitability

I've assumed in this category that the rankings are exactly the same as for Sponsorship.

Team	Rank	Points	Bonus Points	Criteria Point
Brisbane	1	20	13	33
Nth Queensland	2	19	13	32
Melbourne	3	18	13	31
Newcastle	4	17	13	30
Auckland	5	16	13	29
Parramatta	6	15	8	23
Cronulla	7	14	8	22
Canberra	8	13	8	21
Manly	9	12	8	20
Canterbury	10	11	8	19
St George	11	10	4	14
Sydney City	12	9	4	13
Norths	13	8	4	12
Penrith	14	7	4	11
Illawarra	15	6	1	7
Balmain	16	5	1	6
Adelaide	17	4	1	5
Souths	18	3	1	4
Wests	19	2	1	3
Gold Coast	20	1	1	2

Team	Home Crowd	Away Crowd	Competition	Gate Receipt	Sponsorship	Profitability	Grand Total
Brisbane	33	33	33	40	66	33	238
Newcastle	32	22	30.5	41.25	60	30	215.75
Melbourne	30	29	14	37.5	62	31	203.5
Nth Queensland	31	11.5	5	38.75	64	32	182.25
Cronulla*	29	20.5	19	36.25	44	22	170.75
Parramatta*	23	30	19	28.75	46	23	169.75
Manly*	14	31	32	25	40	20	162
St George*	20	32	22	17.5	28	14	133.5
Sydney City*	21	23	26	23.75	26	13	132.75
Canberra	13	14	25	16.25	42	21	131.25
Norths	22	13	30.5	27.5	24	12	129
Auckland	7	7	12.5	13.75	58	29	127.25
Canterbury*	6	19	20	8.75	38	19	110.75
Balmain*	19	20.5	11	26.25	12	6	94.75
Penrith*	12	6	6	7.5	22	11	64.5
Illawarra*	11	4	12.5	13.75	14	7	62.25
Adelaide	5	3	3	6.25	10	5	32.25
Souths*	2	11.5	4	2.5	8	4	32
Wests*	4	5	7	5	6	3	30
Gold Coast	3	2	2	3.25	4	2	16.25

* Sydney Clubs

Naturally the real standings will not be known until after the 1999 Grand Final.

So I pretended I could predict all the results that will contribute to competition points ... just to see what would happen.

For 1999 I have Newcastle as minor premiers, Penrith finish 6th and Brisbane beat Sydney City in the Grand Final.

Team	1999 Rank	Basic Points	(x 4)	Bonus	Grand Final Bonus	Total 1999
Newcastle	1	20	80	13		93
Brisbane	2	19	76	13	10	94
Parramatta	3	18	72	13		85
Melbourne	4	17 (x6)	102	13		115
Sydney City	5	16	64	13	5	82
Penrith	6	15	60	8		68
Canterbury	7	14	56	8		64
Canberra	8	13	52	8		60
Manly	9	12	48	8		56
Cronulla	10	11	44	8		52
Norths	11	10	40	4		44
St George	12	9	36	4		40
Auckland	13	8	32	4		36
Balmain	14	7	28	4		32
Nth Qld	15	6	24	1		25
Illawarra	16	5	20	1		21
Adelaide	17	4 (x6)	24	1		25
Souths	18	3	12	1		13
Wests	19	2	8	1		9
Gold Coast	20	1 (x6)	6	1		7

The hypothetical total competition criteria points with the 1999 Season finishing as per the previous table will be:

Team	Score	Rank	Points	Bonus	Criteria
Brisbane	245	1	20	13	33
Newcastle	224	2	19	13	32
Sydney City	202	3	18	13	31
Melbourne	200	4	17	13	30
Manly	198	5	16	13	29
Canberra	180	6	15	8	23
Norths	175	7	14	8	22
Parramatta	172	8	13	8	21
Canterbury	171	9	12	8	20
Cronulla	161	10	11	8	19
St George	150	11	10	4	14
Penrith	117	12	9	4	13
Auckland	98	13	8	4	12
Balmain	89	14	7	4	11
Illawarra	83	15	6	1	7
Wests	59	16	5	1	6
Nth Queensland	52	17	4	1	5
Adelaide	42	18	3	1	4
Souths	32	19	2	1	3
Gold Coast	16	20	1	1	2

Now, in this hypothetical, lets factor back in the crowd figures with all teams remaining stagnant and every Penrith crowd being 11,500.

Team	Home & Away Crowd Points	Competition Points	Total
Brisbane	66	33	99
Melbourne	59	30	89
Newcastle	54	32	86
Sydney City	44	31	75
Manly	45	29	74
Parramatta	53	21	74
Cronulla	49.5	19	68.5
St George	52	14	66
Norths	35	22	57
Balmain	39.5	11	50.5
Canberra	27	23	50
Nth Qld	42.5	5	47.5
Canterbury	25	20	45
Penrith	19	13	32
Auckland	14	12	26
Illawarra	15	7	22
Souths	13.5	3	16.5
Wests	9	6	15
Adelaide	8	4	12
Gold Coast	5	2	7

To determine an approximate position for crunch time - end Season 99 - I've also made some assumptions about our improvement in the categories of Gate Receipts, Sponsorship & Other Income, and Profitability. The following tables take those improvements into account.

Gate Receipts

I've assumed we take an average of \$6 per head (optimistic) through the gate and our top 16 home crowds average 11,500. In Season 98 we got about \$4.25 for every person in the crowd - this includes Season Ticket revenue.

For other clubs I've assumed stagnant crowds and \$7 per head average entry (low for most teams ranked above us).

This category has a weighting of 1-25.

Here is the result.

Team	Rank	Points	Bonus Points	Criteria
Brisbane	1	20	13	41.25
Newcastle	2	19	13	40
Nth Queensland	3	18	13	38.75
Melbourne	4	17	13	37.5
Cronulla	5	16	13	36.25
Parramatta	6	15	8	28.75
Norths	7	14	8	27.5
Sydney City	8	13	8	26.25
St George	9	12	8	25
Balmain	10	11	8	23.75
Manly	11	10	4	17.5
Canberra	12	9	4	16.25
Penrith	13	8	4	15
Illawarra	14	7	4	13.75
Auckland	15	6	1	8.75
Canterbury	16	5	1	7.5
Adelaide	17	4	1	6.25
Wests	18	3	1	5
Gold Coast	19	2	1	3.75
Souths	20	1	1	2.5

Sponsorship & Other Income

I've ranked us as finishing 6th in this category. In 1997 we were 6th of the surviving 8 Super League Clubs – we beat Cronulla & Adelaide, were marginally behind Canterbury, about 25% below Canberra and miles behind Auckland, Brisbane and North Queensland.

This category aggregates the Sponsorship and Other Income over 1998 and 1999. To finish ranked 6th we would have to do exceptionally well in 1999. My guess is we would have to attract at least \$3 million but maybe up to \$5m in 1999 to achieve this position.

My rankings are:

Team	Rank	Points	Bonus Points	Criteria Point
Brisbane	1	20	13	66
Nth Queensland	2	19	13	64
Melbourne	3	18	13	62
Newcastle	4	17	13	60
Parramatta	5	16	13	58
Penrith	6	15	8	46
Manly	7	14	8	44
Auckland	8	13	8	42
Canberra	9	12	8	40
Norths	10	11	8	38
St George	11	10	4	28
Sydney City	12	9	4	26
Cronulla	13	8	4	24
Canterbury	14	7	4	22
Illawarra	15	6	1	14
Balmain	16	5	1	12
Adelaide	17	4	1	10
Souths	18	3	1	8
Wests	19	2	1	6
Gold Coast	20	1	1	4

Profitability

I've assumed the same ranking as for sponsorship.

Team	Rank	Points	Bonus Points	Total
Brisbane	1	20	13	33
Nth Queensland	2	19	13	32
Melbourne	3	18	13	31
Newcastle	4	17	13	30
Parramatta	5	16	13	29
Penrith	6	15	8	23
Manly	7	14	8	22
Auckland	8	13	8	21
Canberra	9	12	8	20
Norths	10	11	8	19
St George	11	10	4	14
Sydney City	12	9	4	13
Cronulla	13	8	4	12
Canterbury	14	7	4	11
Illawarra	15	6	1	7
Balmain	16	5	1	6
Adelaide	17	4	1	5
Souths	18	3	1	4
Wests	19	2	1	3
Gold Coast	20	1	1	2

The total picture at the end of 1999 if:

- our 1999 crowds are such that our top 16 home crowds average approximately 11,500. (*Note: this means we have to attract 6% of the population within a 10km radius - making us the best in Sydney equal to the Cronulla club*)
- other clubs home crowds are stagnant.
- away crowds rankings stay as they finished this year.
- we finish 6th in 1999.
- we increase our per head gate income to \$6 and other clubs get approximately \$7 per head. (*Note: we are currently achieving about \$4.25 per head - including Season Ticket revenue*)
- we attract at least (but probably more is needed) \$3 million in sponsorship and other income in 1999.
- the profitability rankings are the same as the sponsorship rankings.

If all these "ifs" are fulfilled this is how the final criteria table will look.

Team	Home Crowd	Away Crowd	Competition	Gate Receipt	Sponsorship	Profitability	Grand Total
Brisbane	33	33	33	41.25	66	33	239.25
Melbourne	30	29	30	37.5	62	31	219.5
Newcastle	32	22	32	40	60	30	216
Parramatta*	23	30	21	28.75	58	29	189.75
Nth Queensland	31	11.5	5	38.75	64	32	182.25
Manly*	14	31	29	17.5	44	22	157.5
Norths	22	13	22	27.5	38	19	141.5
Cronulla*	29	20.5	19	36.25	24	12	140.75
Sydney City*	21	23	31	26.25	26	13	140.25
St George*	20	32	14	25	28	14	133
Canberra	13	14	23	16.25	40	20	126.25
Penrith*	13	6	13	15	46	23	116
Auckland	7	7	12	8.75	42	21	97.75
Balmain*	19	20.5	11	23.75	12	6	92.25
Canterbury*	6	19	20	7.5	22	11	85.5
Illawarra*	11	4	7	13.75	14	7	56.75
Adelaide	5	3	4	6.25	10	5	33.25
Souths*	2	11.5	3	2.5	8	4	31
Wests*	4	5	6	5	6	3	29
Gold Coast	3	2	2	3.75	4	2	16.75

* Sydney Clubs

Note: Penrith is ranked 6th of the Sydney clubs. If Canterbury & Wests form a joint venture we will be rated 7th.